Phenix Tools for Cryo-EM: Refinement

Pavel Afonine

LBNL, Berkeley, California, USA

January 30, 2020

Cryo-EM tools in Phenix



Structure refinement

Initial (poor) model

Refinement

Improved (refined) model

Scenarios for model-to-map fitting



Refinement tools in Phenix

Crystallography



Available since 2005



Refinement tools in Phenix

Out Preferences Flep									
Quit Preferences Heip Citations Reload last job Coot PyMOL KING Other tools Ask for help Actions Job history Projects Data analysis Data analysis Show group: All groups Manage Experimental phasing Molecular replacement V Scienci Other tools Settings Molecular replacement Model building ID Last modified # of jobs R-free Refinement Model building ringer Sep 07 2016 05:37 2 Model building Refinement y Sgnn Sep 07 2016 05:23 1 Model building Refinement tmp2 Sep 07 2016 07:23 2 Mutomated X-ray and/or neutron refinement Automated X-ray and/or neutron refinement debug1 Sep 05 2016 10:51 2 0.0086 Automated real-space refinement tmp4 Aug 18 2016 07:23 1 Phenix.refine Automated real-space refinement almu Jul 28 2016 10:54 1 DEN refinement [alpha] Deformable elastic network refinement using : DEN refinement	🔘 🔏	?	2	2.	* 5	K	se.		
Actions Job history Projects Data analysis Show group: All groups Manage Select Date of jobs Refinement Solder New project Settings Molecular replacement ID Last modified # of jobs R-free Model building ringer Sep 07 2016 05:37 2 Model building Tmp2 Sep 07 2016 05:23 1 phenix.refine Sgnn Sep 07 2016 00:51 2 0.0086 Real-space refinement tmp4 Aug 18 2016 07:23 2 Neutron refinement Automated real-space refinement mich Jul 29 2016 11:54 1 DEN refinement [alpha] Alternate phenix.refine interface customized fi mich Jul 22 2016 11:10 1 DEN refinement [alpha] Deformable elastic network refinement using : milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 Browse C PHENIX version dev-svn-000 Project: 5gnn	Quit Preferences	Help Citations Re	load last job	Coot Py	MOL Kil	NG	Other tools	Ask for help	
Projects Data analysis Show group: All groups Manage Experimental phasing Solect Select	Actions Job history								
Show group: All groups Manage Experimental phasing Soloct Select Image: Imag	Projects					Data analysis			
Version of the second secon	Show group: All groups Show group:					Experimental phasing			
ID Last modified # of jobs R-free ringer Sep 07 2016 05:37 2 tmp2 Sep 07 2016 05:23 1 Sgnn Sep 07 2016 05:23 1 debug1 Sep 05 2016 10:51 2 0.0086 tmp4 Aug 18 2016 07:23 2 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 almu Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 Current directory: /Users/pafonine/Desktop/work/tmp Browse R PHENIX version dev-svn-000 Project: 5gnn	Select O Delete New project Settings					Molecular replacement			
ID Last modified # of jobs R-free ringer Sep 07 2016 05:37 2 tmp2 Sep 07 2016 05:23 1 Sgnn Sep 07 2016 08:42 1 debug1 Sep 05 2016 10:51 2 0.0086 tmp4 Aug 18 2016 07:23 2 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 almu Jul 28 2016 10:58 1 mich Jul 22 2016 11:10 1 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 DEN refinement [alpha] Deformable elastic network refinement using s milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 EM Iul 14 2016 05:00 14 0.1570 Browse Current directory: /Users/pafonine/Desktop/work/tmp Browse PHENIX version dev-syn-000 Project: 5gnn						Model building			
Initiger Sep 07 2016 05:37 2 Image: Proceeding of the process of the proces	ID	Last modified	# of jobs R-free			Refir	nement		
Imp2 Step 07 2016 08:25 m 1 Imp2 <	tmp2	Sep 07 2010 05.37 Sep 07 2016 05:23	. 2			<i>(</i> P)			
debug1 Sep 05 2016 10:51 2 0.0086 tmp4 Aug 18 2016 07:23 2 testing Aug 11 2016 01:54 1 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 almu Jul 28 2016 10:58 1 milya Jul 15 2016 11:10 1 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 DEN refinement [alpha] Deformable elastic network refinement using s Deformable elastic network refinement using s Mul 14 2016 05:20 14 0.1570 Browse PHENIX version dev-svn-000 Project: 5gnn	sann	Sep 07 2016 03:23 Sep 07 2016 08:42	1				pnenix.renne	Vor neutron refinement	
debug f Deep 05 2010 10.01 m. 2 0.0000 tmp4 Aug 18 2016 07:23 2 testing Aug 11 2016 01:54 1 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 1 almu Jul 28 2016 10:58 1 rchen Jul 22 2016 11:10 1 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 DEN refinement [alpha] Deformable elastic network refinement using s Deformable elastic network refinement using s Deformable elastic network refinement using s DEN Mul 14 2016 05:20 14 0.1570 PHENIX version dev-svn-000 Project: 5gnn	debug1	Sep 07 2010 00.42 Sep 05 2016 10:51	2 0.0086			Star.	Automateu X-Tay and	i/or neutron remement	
Imp4 Aug 10 2010 07.25 m 2 Automated real-space refinement testing Aug 11 2016 01:54 m 1 mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 m 1 almu Jul 28 2016 10:58 m 1 rchen Jul 22 2016 11:10 m 1 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 m 2 EM Jul 14 2016 05:20 14 0.1570 Current directory: /Users/pafonine/Desktop/work/tmp Browse Q PHENIX version dev-syn-000 Project: 5gnn	tmp4	Aug 18 2016 07:23	2	,			Real-space refin	nement	
testing Aug TT 2010 01:04 m. 1 Aug mich Jul 29 2016 12:47 m. 1 almu Jul 28 2016 10:58 m. 1 rchen Jul 22 2016 11:10 m. 1 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 m. 2 DEN refinement [alpha] Deformable elastic network refinement using s Deformable elastic network refinement using s Deformable elastic network refinement using s Current directory: /Users/pafonine/Desktop/work/tmp Browse PHENIX version dev-syn-000 Project: 5gnn	testing	Aug 10 2010 01:20	1				Automated real-spac	e refinement	
Inicitie Jul 28 2010 12:47 Image: Construction of the second s	mich		. 1				Neutron refinem	nent [alpha]	
aintu Jul 28 2010 10.36 I I III rchen Jul 22 2016 11:10 1 DEN refinement [alpha] milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 Deformable elastic network refinement using s Current directory: /Users/pafonine/Desktop/work/tmp Browse Q PHENIX version dev-syn-000 Project: 5gnn	almu		1				Alternate phenix.refine interface customized for		
Inchem Sull 22 2010 11.10 1 milya Jul 15 2016 12:36 2 Imilya Jul 14 2016 05:20 Imilya Deformable elastic network refinement using s Imilya Jul 14 2016 05:20 Imilya Deformable elastic network refinement using s Imilya Jul 14 2016 05:20 Imilya Deformable elastic network refinement using s Imilya Imilya Imilya Jul 14 2016 05:20 Imilya Deformable elastic network refinement using s Imilya Imilya Imilya Imilya <	rchen	Jul 22 2016 11:10	1				DEN refinement	[alpha]	
Current directory: /Users/pafonine/Desktop/work/tmp PHENIX version dev-svn-000 Project: 5gnn	milva	Jul 15 2016 12:26	· ·				Deformable elastic ne	etwork refinement using s	
Current directory: /Users/pafonine/Desktop/work/tmp Browse PHENIX version dev-svn-000 Project: 5gnn	oEM	Jul 14 2016 05:20	2	`					
PHENIX version dev-svn-000 Project: 5gnn	Current directory:	/Users/pafonine/Deskto	pp/work/tmp				Browse		
	PHENIX version dev-svn-000						Project: 5gnn		

Real-space refinement with *phenix.real_space_refine*

- No Fourier space involved
- No structure factors
- No R-factors
- Model refined directly into the map



Repurposing crystallographic software for cryo-EM



- Is conversion map to structure factors lossless?
- Are crystal bulk-solvent and anisotropic scaling still applicable?
- *R* factors will largely depend on masking used. What is R_{free}?
- 2mFo-DFc and mFo-DFc maps?
- Form-factors ?

Map to structure factors conversion



• Lossless conversion: *ρ* <> *F*

Map to structure factors conversion

Map in real space (ρ)



Map in Fourier space (F) truncated by resolution (red sphere)

Not a lossless conversion: ρ <> F

Real-space refinement

- Calculations are faster
 - Large models
 - Quick turn-around when model building or development
- Local targets
 - Easy to make parallel
 - Employ methods with large convergence radii
- Weight between data and restraints
 - Can always be optimized
 - Can vary across reconstruction volume

Real-space refinement: local data/restraints weight

• PDB code: 5LDF



Coscia et al (2016). Sci. Reports, 6, 30909

Resolution (map quality) varies across the volume

Real-space refinement: local data/restraints weight

• 5LDF



$T = T_{\text{DATA}}(\rho_{\text{OBS}}, \rho_{\text{MODEL}}) + wT_{\text{RESTRAINTS}}$

• Contribution of restraints can be weighted by local map quality

- Poorer resolved regions may be restrained stronger
- Better resolved regions may use less restraints and more data
 - Local optimal weight can be quickly obtained in real space

phenix.real_space_refine

- Best model-map fit. Any map: X-ray, neutron, EM. Any resolution
- Refined models: no poor validation metrics
- Fast (minutes a few hours, not days or many hours)
 - Make use of multiple CPUs: as many as available
- Large convergence radius
- Easy to use: map and model in, refined model out
- Accessible: no special hardware requirements

Refinement target

• Least-squares (map similarity) or cross-correlation:

$$LS = \sum_{all \ grid \ points} (\rho_{obs} - k * \rho_{calc})^2 \qquad CC = \frac{\sum_n \rho_{obs} \rho_{calc}}{\sum_n \rho_{obs}^2 \sum_n \rho_{calc}^2}$$

 ho_{obs} = experimental map ho_{calc} = model calculated map

- Accurate (matches shape of model-calculated map with experimental map)
- Very slow to calculate
 - Not used in *phenix.real_space_refine*

Refinement target

• Atom-centered:

$$T = -\sum_{atoms} \rho_{obs}(x_{atom}, y_{atom}, z_{atom})$$

 x_{atom} , y_{atom} , z_{atom} = coordinates of atom center

- Less accurate
- Very fast to calculate (more than 100 times faster than LS or CC)
 - Used in *phenix.real_space_refine*

Refinement target

• Atom-centered:

$$T = -\sum_{atoms} \rho_{obs}(x_{atom}, y_{atom}, z_{atom})$$

 x_{atom} , y_{atom} , z_{atom} = coordinates of atom center

• Why it is less accurate?



Moving atoms to nearest peaks \neq making correct model

Target calculation example

PDB: 5VKU 3720 chains | 1,872,060 residues | 14,917,620 atoms



- Calculate one set of ρ_{calc} never finished on my laptop
- Calculate real-space refinement target – several seconds

$$T = -\sum_{atoms} \rho(x_{atom}, y_{atom}, z_{atom})$$

Automated model refinement: phenix.real_space_refine



Automated model refinement: phenix.real_space_refine



Morphing

Start model before refinement



After *phenix.real_space_refine*



Model regularization



Model regularization



Before and after regilarization

less than 1.5Å



- Lower the resolution, less detailed the map
 - Need extra information to keep correct geometry during refinement

$$T = T_{\text{DATA}} + wT_{\text{RESTRAINTS}}$$

 $T_{RESTRAINTS} = T_{BOND} + T_{ANGLE} + T_{DIHEDRAL} + T_{PLANARITY} + T_{NONBONDED} + T_{CHIRALITY}$

• Low resolution map is not sufficient to maintain secondary



- Example: refinement of a perfect α-helix into low-res map
 - Using standard restraints on covalent geometry isn't sufficient
 - Model geometry deteriorates as result of refinement





 $T_{\text{RESTRAINTS}} = T_{\text{BOND}} + T_{\text{ANGLE}} + \dots + T_{\text{NCS}} + T_{\text{RAMACHANDRAN}} + T_{\text{REFERENCE}} + \dots$

NCS (internal symmetry): constraints vs restraints





- **Constraints**: molecules 1, 2 and 3 are required to be identical
- **Restraints**: molecules 1, 2 and 3 are required to be similar but not necessarily identical
- *phenix.real_space_refine*: only NCS constraints available

- Running with all defaults is ok in most cases
- Minimal required inputs:
 - Model, map and map resolution
 - Map resolution is only used to calculate CC for your information and does not affect refinement results in any way
- Need to adjust parameters
 - Something isn't quite right with the refined model
 - Input model is poor and needs many adjustments to fit the map
- Refinement at 3-3.5 Å and lower, always use:
 - Ramachandran plot restraints
 - Secondary structure restraints
 - Reference model restraints (if quality homology model is available)
 - "NCS" (molecular symmetry)

- NCS:
 - Symmetry related copies:
 - Can be found automatically as part of refinement or using phenix.simple_ncs_from_pdb tool
 - Can be specified manually
 - Automatic determination relies on model quality
 - Always check automatically detected NCS copies!
 - Symmetrized map:
 - Always use NCS constraints
 - Symmetry was not used in reconstruction, resolution:
 - Better than 2.0Å: don't use NCS
 - 2-3.5 (or 4) Å: use NCS restraints

- Secondary structure (SS) annotation
 - SS information is encoded as HELIX/SHEET records in PDB file or equivalent in mmCIF file
 - *phenix.secondary_structure_restraints* can create SS annotation
 - No software can annotate SS fully reliably and correctly!
- Secondary structure (SS) restraints:
 - Always use at 3Å and worse
 - Better than 3Å: use if needed (model has geometry violations)
 - Setting up SS restraints:
 - Use one of available SS annotation tools to get initial draft
 - Before using in refinement, manually validate and edit initial annotation to make it as accurate as possible
 - Incorrect SS annotation will propagate into refined model

- Ramachandran plot restraints
 - Always use at 3Å and worse
 - Better than 3Å: use if needed (model has geometry violations)
 - Don't use to fix outliers. Fix outliers first, then use Ramachandran plot restraints to stop re-occurring outliers..
 - Check Ramachandran plot regularly (see Validation topic)

- Ramachandran plot restraints
 - Don't use to fix outliers. Fix outliers first, then use Ramachandran plot restraints to prevent re-occurring outliers..



Bad idea to use Ramachandran plot restraints in this case. Fix outliers first!

- Ramachandran plot restraints
 - Use to stop outliers from occurring

Before refinement

After refinement



Good idea to use Ramachandran plot restraints!

- mmCIF file format for atomic models
 - Mandatory use for crystallographic models since July 2019
 - PDB formatted files are not accepted any more
 - Some cryo-EM models may be large enough to not fit into PDB file format
 - Phenix provides full support for mmCIF I/O



Resources



Phenix paper Video tutorials Documentation Relevant papers Bi-annual newsletters Slides from workshops

Resources



User support

• Feedback, questions, help

phenixbb@phenix-online.org bugs@phenix-online.org help@phenix-online.org

- Reporting a bug or asking for help:
 - We can't help you if you don't help us to understand your problem
 - Make sure the problem still exist using the latest *Phenix* version
 - Send us all inputs (files, non-default parameyters) and tell us steps that lead to the problem

Subscribe to Phenix mailing list: www.phenix-online.org